URBANIZATION, FOOD SYSTEMS, AND THE DIET TRANSFORMATION IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES: WHAT DO WE KNOW, AND WHAT DO WE NEED TO KNOW?

David Tschirley
Keynote Address for “Hungry Cities: The Global Revolution in Food Systems”
Sponsored by the ILSI Research Foundation
La Jolla, CA, 23 January, 2017
BACKGROUND

Extensive analysis of household expenditure data sets across Africa and Asia
Processed foods inventories
“Stacked surveys” of rapidly growing value chains
30 years of fieldwork in Africa and Asia
A focus on linking rural and urban, not just on urban needs
What do we know?
#1: DIETS ARE TRANSFORMING IN THREE WAYS

Food is becoming more purchased

- About 50% of food in rural areas of Africa (by value) is purchased
- 60% to 70% in Asia
#1: DIETS ARE TRANSFORMING IN THREE WAYS

Food is becoming more perishable
- meats, dairy, fresh produce (especially fruit and new vegetables)
- Non-cereals are 50% to 70% of diets in value terms
Food is becoming more processed and prepared

- 50% to 65% of all food is now processed
- 70% to 80% of purchased food
- Food away from home exceeds 15% of food expenditure in some countries of ESA
- and is growing everywhere more rapidly than any other category
Every one of these transformations means the post-farm segment of the agrifood system is becoming ever more important.
#2: THE TRANSFORMATION IS NOT JUST AN URBAN MIDDLE CLASS STORY

The transformation is **broad**
- In rural and urban areas
- Across Africa and Asia
- Across the income distribution (not just the poor)
## Categorization Scheme Used in LSMS Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unprocessed</th>
<th>Processed, Low Value Added</th>
<th>Processed, High Value Added</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-perishable</strong></td>
<td>Legumes</td>
<td>Maize meal Milled Rice Sugar Others</td>
<td>Veg oils Breads Food away from home Others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maize grain</td>
<td>Others</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Perishable</strong></td>
<td>Vegetables</td>
<td>Beef Other meat (incl. poultry) Dried/pkgd fish Others</td>
<td>Food away from home Dairy Others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fresh fish</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fruit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Kernel regression results on purchased food budget shares, additionally weighted by population across 5 countries of ESA

Source: Author calculations from LSMS data sets
Kernel regression results on purchased food budget shares, additionally weighted by population across 5 countries of ESA.

Source: Author calculations from LSMS data sets.
Kernel regression results on purchased food budget shares, additionally weighted by population across 5 countries of ESA

Source: Author calculations from LSMS data sets
Kernel regression results on purchased food budget shares, additionally weighted by population across 5 countries of ESA.
Kernel regression results on purchased food budget shares, additionally weighted by population across 5 countries of ESA

![Graph showing Dramatic diet change has already occurred by the time a household rises up to the international poverty line.](image)

Source: Author calculations from LSMS data sets
Kernel regression results on purchased food budget shares, additionally weighted by population across 5 countries of ESA

So there is enormous pressure on the agrifood system, NOW, to respond

Source: Author calculations from LSMS data sets
Urban demand now over 50% of all food demand through markets in East and Southern Africa
- The least urbanized area of the continent
- Up to 70% and 80% elsewhere

Very rapid growth
- 3% to 4% growth in urban populations PLUS …
- 2% to 5% growth in per capita incomes …
- means explosive growth in urban demand through markets
- Up to 8x over 30 years
#3: URBAN DEMAND IS DRIVING THE TRANSFORMATION

- Urban demand now over 50% of all food demand through markets in East and Southern Africa
  - the least urbanized area of the continent
  - Up to 70% and 80% elsewhere

- Very rapid growth
  - 3% to 4% growth in urban populations PLUS ...
  - 2% to 5% growth in per capita incomes ...
  - means explosive growth in urban demand through markets

  *Up to 8x over 30 years*
#3: URBAN DEMAND IS DRIVING THE TRANSFORMATION

- Especially secondary and tertiary cities
  - About 60% of urban population, growing rapidly
  - A chance to “get it right” in urban areas with little marketing infrastructure
About 90% of all food is from local production
And reliance on imports is not systematically rising, even in Africa
#4: LOCAL DEMAND AND SUPPLY DOMINATE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Real value of food imports</th>
<th>Imports as share of food expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>↔</td>
<td>↓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COMTRADE for imports; WB for hh consumption expenditure; authors’ calculations to generate food expenditure
#4: LOCAL DEMAND AND SUPPLY DOMINATE

## Real value of food imports, 2008-2015 (2011 PPP USD)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Real value of food imports</th>
<th>Imports as share of food expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>↔</td>
<td>↓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COMTRADE for imports; WB for hh consumption expenditure; authors’ calculations to generate food expenditure
#4: LOCAL DEMAND AND SUPPLY DOMINATE

### Real value of food imports, 2008-2015 (2011 PPP USD)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Real value of food imports</th>
<th>Imports as share of food expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>↑</td>
<td>↔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>↔</td>
<td>↓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COMTRADE for imports; WB for hh consumption expenditure; authors’ calculations to generate food expenditure
#4: LOCAL DEMAND AND SUPPLY DOMINATE

- In urban East and Southern Africa, the import share in the diet does not rise with income.
- Import shares do rise with income in rural areas ...
- And they are higher in urban- than in rural areas.
- But both appear to be driven by the move to purchased food, not by income per se.
Contrary to conventional wisdom, many countries in Africa are “holding their own” in meeting their food needs, and rising incomes per se should not change this
#5: FLOW OF FOOD BI- AND EVEN TRI-DIRECTIONAL

- Rural-urban
  - What we’ve always known
  - But now more than ever, linking to urban demand is central to rural growth and poverty alleviation
- Urban-rural
  - Flow of processed foods out to small towns and rural areas
  - Might this change with more distributed energy generation (solar)?
- Rural-rural
  - e.g. oilseed processing concentrated in areas around production, then flows to other rural areas
#6: CITIES ARE NOT ADEQUATELY PREPARED
#6: CITIES ARE NOT ADEQUATELY PREPARED

- 10 Asian cities and 11 of SSA have signed the Milan Urban Food Pact
- But very little investment (certainly in SSA)
  - Unsuccessful attempts (Nairobi)
- Appalling conditions (at least in Africa)
- Outmoded models for investment and management in urban marketing infrastructure
- Food not being integrated into urban planning
  - Africa and Asia
In Africa, the supermarket revolution is obvious, but very young. Supermarket sales need to rise by more than 5% per year just to maintain their small market share!

Private investment cannot be expected to solve the dramatic inadequacy of urban marketing infrastructure in the short- to medium-term.
Three broad implications
IMPLICATIONS

Massive agribusiness opportunities
- Who’s going to capture the growth?
- Imports, or local farmers and processors?
- If local: large, medium, or small?

Massive challenge for cities
- Need for new physical infrastructure
- New ownership and management models

Increasing importance of food quality and safety
What we need to know
(an incomplete list!)
#1: WHO IS RESPONDING TO THE OPPORTUNITIES?

- What is the level, structure, and spatial distribution of the local agribusiness response?
- Major implications for level and location of employment
  - Among Tanzanian millers:
    - smallest 20% of grain millers employ 15x more labor per unit output
    - Next smallest employ 6x as many
#1: WHO IS RESPONDING TO THE OPPORTUNITIES?

▪ What’s the role of smallholder farmers in the emerging supply chains?
▪ Are more effective linkages emerging, or will they be bypassed?
▪ … as they largely are by the rapidly growing but still small supermarket sector
#2: HOW RAPIDLY ARE SUPERMARKETS TAKING OVER MARKET SHARE?

- Currently low in Africa and S Asia, higher in E and SE Asia
- The sector can grow very rapidly in total sales while growing very slowly in market share
- Continuing role, for a long time, for the so-called traditional marketing system
#3: ARE SMES BAD FOR SAFETY AND QUALITY?

How does nutritional quality and food safety vary by:

- Imported vs. local products?
- Firm size among locals?
- Some concerned that SMEs are a major problem for food safety
#4: WHAT ARE THE OBESOGENIC FOODS AND HOW ARE THEY REACHING CONSUMERS?
We may be accustomed to thinking about the degradation of developing country diets as a product only of FDI, and packaged foods.
Traditional prepared foods, and traditional market outlets, can be major elements of this problem.
#5: HOW CAN WE FOSTER COMPETITIVE RESPONSE BY LOCAL SMES?

The role of credible public grades and standards for quality and safety
  • Piggybacking by the small guys

Lots of agencies to promote small industry but have been marginally effective

**Scalable renewable energy?**

Cooperative wholesaling models?

*It’s probably about slowing consolidation, not stopping it*
#6: HOW CAN WE HELP (AFRICAN?) CITIES BREAK OUT OF THEIR DYSFUNCTIONAL APPROACH TO URBAN FOOD MARKETING?

New models of ownership and management
Integrating food into urban planning
Modifying the food environment to promote healthy food choices
Must deal with the political economy problem
Questions?